

# VILLAGE OF EPHRAIM

FOUNDED 1853



## Historic Preservation Committee Meeting Minutes Tuesday, October 29, 2024 – 6:30 PM

**Present:** Kenneth Nelson-Chair, Kathy Pentler, Amy Russell

**Absent:** Marilyn Cushing, Cody Schreck

**Staff:** Brent Bristol- Administrator, Andrea Collak – Clerk/Treasurer

**Guests:** Randy Nelson, Grace Held, John Held, Monique McClean, BD Thorp, Susie Samson, Kelsey Stone, Michael McCutcheon, Andrew Bartelt

1. **Call to order:** The meeting was called to order by Ken Nelson -Chair at 6:30 PM.
2. **Quorum:** A quorum is present for this meeting.
3. **Changes in Agenda:** None
4. **Visitors' comments:** None
5. **Previous minutes:** Minutes from 6/25/2024

<b>Russell moved, Pentler seconded to approve HPC minutes from June 25, 2024, as presented, all ayes, and the motion carried.</b>
---

### 6. **RaeAnne LLC – 9922 Water St – Accessory Structure/Railing**

Bristol noted that the building was before the committee a few times. This time there was some work done (fence/railing and pergola erected) without permitting. Bristol talked to the applicant, and this application is an attempt to get after the work permits. The applicant wanted to replace the wood picket fence with an aluminum railing and add the accessory structure – an aluminum pergola to the north side of the building. The picture was presented for review. The project meets all dimensional standards. Bristol read the letter from an applicant.

Mike Tomasian, in his letter to the committee, apologized for not being able to attend the meeting. Tomasian stated that this project went from a simple remodel to a major commercial build. It took his wife Shannon and him by complete surprise at how bad this building was. The previous owner had hidden all the rot with spray foam insulation, and they wound up having to take out massive loans to restore this beautiful building. They managed to save the historic chimney at a great cost to them, but they are very happy with the architectural beauty of this new building, and they hope it will stand the test of time. Tomasian and his wife had gone to the Shorewood Condo Association and had approval for the commercial railing etc. It is ADA approved and is “wood like” in that it has the attributes of a typical wood railing but is powder coated aluminum for strength and longevity. There will never be rust or rotted wood as this is impervious to the elements. Tomasian noted that they had no idea they needed further approval and if they had they certainly would have come before the Village. They thought they were doing a good thing, and they truly hope and ask for approval as they have a tremendous investment in this project. The pergola is to help keep patrons shaded and dry in inclement weather. They thought umbrellas that blow around and poke people would be bad, so they wanted a better solution. They really want to be good stewards of this property and good members of the community, and they are excited to hopefully be serving the best donuts and coffee soon.

Bristol mentioned that Cody Schreck could not attend this meeting and offer a vote, but he put his thoughts into writing so they could be read during the meeting.

Schreck in his note stated that he finds it troubling that the committee is assessing an accessory structure item that has already been installed. Especially since it has seemingly not been put

forward to HPC in any capacity before this. Schreck knows the conversation here involves the idea of precedent in that other structures in the historic district have been approved for black fences, but the precedent he is more concerned with is allowing property owners to ask forgiveness rather than permission. That is where the integrity of a historic district will begin to fall apart. If his understanding is correct in that RaeAnne LLC installed this fence without going through the proper channels first, then he firmly believes they should be required to remove it until a proposal they provide has been approved by the HPC and Plan Committee. This is especially true given that there appears to have been no attempt made by RaeAnne LLC to abide by the Historic District Ordinance to make fences wood or wood-like and natural-colored. Putting the HPC stamp of approval of this project as it is, would effectively set the standard that others can build/add/renovate structures as they fit without regard to the Historic Ordinance or HPC/Plan Committee approval process.

The other committee members agreed with Schreck's comments. Pentler noted that it is not Ephraim look or historic look at all. There were a few projects turned down recently that had to come back with modifications to the proposed aluminum/iron railings/fences. There are products in different colors that will give a wood-like, historic look without the maintenance. It can be done, and it needs to be enforced so these projects can be an asset to the Historic District and community.

Russell said that aesthetically it looks nice, but it is not historical. It does not look like Ephraim. It should be traditional wood fencing, dry stone, or wood-like fencing/railing. There is a lot of black creeping in. It has a very modern look. Can the same look be achieved with wood or natural/wood-like-looking material? Do they even need the fence/railing?

Nelson read from the ordinance *“Traditional fences in the district were dry stone and wood fencing, which represent a historically authentic kind of fencing. In the case of metal, vinyl, or plastic fences, samples must be provided for evaluation by the Historic Preservation Committee for referral to the Plan Committee. This will provide the use of non-traditional materials that reflect the look of traditional fencing.”*

Nelson noted that the applicant should have provided material samples of the railing and accessory building especially if absent. From the picture the pergola looks metal, not wood-like at all. It does not match the rest of the building. Committee members agreed with Nelson.

Pentler noted that the applicant worked so hard, and they did a really good job with the building itself. However, the pergola and fencing/railing do not match and are not acceptable.

Russell added that people who buy into the Historic District need to understand and be serious about historic standards and requirements. Residents in the Historic District are limited in what they can do with their property. They should acknowledge that before buying into a historic community to ensure the consistency in Historic District.

**Russell moved, Nelson seconded to recommend the approval of the Accessory Structure/Railing application to the Plan Committee for RaeAnne LLC at 9922 Water Street, as submitted, all nays, and the motion failed.**

**7. Bethany Lutheran Church – 3028 County Q – Design Review - Addition**

Bristol noted that the applicant would like to demolish the existing 1950s addition and construct a new, bigger 410 sq. ft. addition with ADA compliant bathroom, vestry/conference room, and small kitchenette. It would be wood frame construction with a gable roof 8/12 pitch using gray asphalt shingles. White (natural Door County limestone) and 6” painted cedar beveled siding and trim, double hung wood windows will be added. All materials would match the existing materials on the church. All existing vegetation and topography would remain as is. The Bethany Lutheran Church has never had a source of water. They would like to share the well with the Pioneer Schoolhouse. Ephraim Historical Foundation (EHF) owns both buildings, the Pioneer Schoolhouse and the Bethany Lutheran Church. Bristol has no issues with the proposed addition.

Cody Schreck noted in his notes to the committee that the Ephraim Historical Foundation Board of Directors met on Friday, October 25, and the Bethany addition was included as part of the agenda. From a design standpoint, there were no motions made to deny the addition as presented. However, the point was specifically made by the EHF board that we do not give permission to tap into the Pioneer Schoolhouse well yet. That aspect of the project is not specifically relevant to HPC, as the committee is bound by the aesthetic regulations of the Historic Ordinance, but it is relevant to the overall project and the Plan Committee's considerations. In short, before EHF makes a motion to approve Bethany tapping into the existing well it was agreed that more data needs to be gathered on the codes/policies on the existing well, the age/capacity of the well, and that there needs to be a Memorandum of Understanding created between EHF and Bethany outlining responsibilities for utility bills, maintenance, etc.

The committee members had no issues with the proposed addition.

**Pentler moved, Russell seconded to recommend the approval of the Design Review/Addition application to the Plan Committee for Bethany Lutheran Church at 3028 County Q, as submitted, all ayes, and the motion carried.**

**8. Discussion regarding seasonal waterfront snow fence installation**

Nelson said that the committee was asked to take an initial look at the seasonal waterfront snow fence installation. It has been installed to prevent sand from blowing off the lake into the properties and to protect them. During the streetscape many historic stone fences were uncovered that were buried under the sand. The committee should have a discussion regarding the time the temporary fences should be installed and taken down, their height, and materials to achieve a consistent look. John Held installed a temporary 2 ft tall plywood fence at his property this year.

John Held noted that he tried a few variations in the past years but none of them was successful in keeping the sand off his property. This is the first year he tried plywood. Ideally, he would like to be able to erect the temporary fence as early as the beginning of October and take it down at the beginning of May.

Specific guidelines regarding the time, height and materials of the snow fences will be discussed at the future meeting.

9. **New Business for Next Meeting:** Seasonal Waterfront Snow Fence Installation. Committee members suggested a working session to talk about fences and railings.

10. **Adjournment**

**Russell moved, Nelson seconded to adjourn the Historic Preservation Committee Meeting at 7:10 PM, all ayes, and the motion carried.**

Recorded by

Andrea Collak- Clerk/Treasurer

DRAFT